

DRAFT RESETTLEMENT FRAMEWORK

SOLID WASTE EMERGENCY AND EFFICIENCY PROJECT (SWEEP)

November 3, 2020

DRAFT

SINDH SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT BOARD (SSWMB)

KARACHI

List of Tables	iii
ABBREVIATIONS & ACRONYMS.....	i
Executive Summary.....	ii
1. PROJECT DESCRIPTION.....	5
1.1 Context.....	5
1.2 Description of the Proposed Project Components.....	5
1.2.1 Component 1: Immediate Emergency Response Interventions.....	5
1.2.2 Component 2: Development of SWM Backbone Infrastructure.....	5
1.2.3 Component 3: Project Management and Implementation Support.....	5
1.3 Need for Resettlement Policy Framework.....	5
2. PRINCIPLES AND OBJECTIVES OF RESETTLEMENT PREPERATION AND IMPLEMENTATION.....	6
2.1 The Resettlement Framework (RF).....	6
2.1.1 Principles and Objectives.....	6
3. SOCIAL CONTEXT AND BASELINE CONDITIONS.....	7
3.1 Overview.....	7
3.2 Proposed Subproject Sites.....	7
3.2.1 Jam Chakro Dumpsite.....	7
3.2.2 <i>Kachra kundis</i> in Karachi City.....	8
3.2.3 Construction/Upgrading of Transfer Facilities.....	8
3.2.4 Proposed Waste Treatment Plant in Dhabeji.....	8
3.2.5 Development of solutions to improve treatment of non-municipal waste streams.....	8
4. PROCESS FOR PREPARING AND APPROVING RPs.....	9
4.1 Social Impact Assessment.....	9
4.1.1 Initial Screening Exercise.....	9
4.1.2 Census Survey.....	9
4.1.3 Baseline Socioeconomic Profile.....	9
4.1.4 Detailed Measurement Survey.....	9
4.1.5 Screening of Vulnerable Households.....	9
4.1.6 Resettlement Database.....	10
4.2 Valuation of Land and other Assets.....	10
4.3 Information Dissemination Relating to IR and Mitigation Measures.....	10
4.4 RPs Approval, Clearance and Disclosure.....	10
5. ESTIMATED DISPLACEMENT IMPACTS.....	11
5.1 Potential Resettlement Impacts.....	11
5.2 Gender and Vulnerability Impacts.....	12
6. ELEGIBILITY CRITERIA FOR DEFINING VARIOUS CATEGORIES OF DISPLACED PERSONS.....	13
6.1 Compensation Eligibility.....	13
6.1.1 Cut-off Date.....	13
6.1.2 Eligibility.....	13
6.2 Entitlements.....	13

6.2.1	Residential and commercial structures	13
6.2.2	Communal, public and cultural structures and utilities	14
6.2.3	Livelihood restoration	14
6.2.4	Resettlement and Relocation Assistance	15
6.3	Entitlement Matrix	15
6.5.1	Provisions for Women APs	17
7	LEGAL AND POLICY FRAMEWORK.....	19
7.1	Legal and Policy Framework.....	19
7.1.1	Pakistan’s Laws and Regulations	19
7.1.2	World Bank ESS5 and Resettlement Principles.....	20
7.2	Bridging Gaps and Resettlement Principles Applicable for the Project.....	20
7.3	Change of Subproject Scope or identification of Unanticipated Impacts.....	21
8	METHODS OF VALUING AFFECTED ASSETS.....	22
8.1	Valuation of Lost Affected Assets.....	22
8.1.1	Temporary occupation of land	22
8.1.2	Affected Assets	22
9	ORGANIZATIONAL PROCEDURES FOR DELIVERY OF COMPENSATION AND RESETTLEMENT ASSISTANCE.....	23
9.1	Institutional Roles and Responsibilities.....	23
9.2	Project Implementation Unit (PIU).....	23
9.3	Environment and Social Cell (ESC)	24
9.4	Grievance Redress Committee	24
9.5	Supervisory Consultants	25
9.6	Independent Monitoring Agency (IMA).....	25
11.1	Existing Mechanisms	27
11.2	GRM Systems for the Project	27
11.3	GRM System.....	28
11.4	Handling Gender Based Violence (GBV) and Violence and Against Children (VAC) issues	29
12.1	Preparation of Cost Estimates	30
12.2	Flow of funds	30
12.3	Contingency arrangement	30
12.4	RP Implementation Schedule and Commencement of Works.....	30
13	STAKEHOLDER CONSULTATION AND INFORMATION DISCLOSURE.....	32
13.1	Consultation with Key Stakeholders.....	32
13.2	Consultations Framework during Project Implementation	32
13.3	RP Disclosure and Dissemination	33
14	MONITORING AND EVALUATION	34
14.1	Overview	34
14.2	Internal Monitoring	34
14.3	External Monitoring	35
14.4	Reporting and Disclosure Requirements `	36

List of Tables

Table 1: Eligibility and Compensation Entitlement Matrix	15
Table 2: Constitution of the Grievance Redress Committee	28
Table 3: Potential indicators for internal monitoring	34
Table 4: Potential Indicators for External Monitor	35

DRAFT

ABBREVIATIONS & ACRONYMS

AD	Assistant Director
AP	Affected Person
CLICK	Competitive and Livable City of Karachi
DD	Deputy Director
DMC	District Municipal Corporation
ESC	Environment & Social Cell
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
GoS	Government of Sindh
GRC	Grievance Redress Cell
GRC	Grievance Redress Committee
GRM	Grievance Redress Mechanism
HH	Household
IA	Implementing Agency
IMA	Independent Monitoring Agency
IP	Indigenous People
KMC	Karachi Metropolitan Corporation
LGD	Local Government Department
M&E	Monitoring and evaluation
MD	Managing Director
MP	Mitigation Plan
MRF	Material Recovery Facility
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
P&DD	Planning & Development Department
PAHs	Project Affected Households
PD	Project Director
PDOs	Project Development Objectives
PIU	Project Implementation Unit
RP	Resettlement Plan
RF	Resettlement Framework
ROW	Right-of-Way
RF	Resettlement Framework
SEPA	Sindh Environmental Protection Agency
SIA	Social Impact Assessment
SSWMB	Sindh Solid Waste Management Board
SWEEP	Sindh Waste Emergency and Efficiency Project
TORs	Terms of References
ULGs	Urban Local Governments
WB	World Bank
WTP	Waste Treatment Plant
WHO	World Health Organization

Executive Summary

Project Description

The proposed project will finance interventions that will be implemented over two phases: (a) in the immediate emergency response phase, activities will aim to mitigate (i) high flooding risks linked to the 2020 monsoon and caused by accumulation of solid waste in the city's natural drainage channels (*nullahs*), as well as (ii) public health risks caused by exposure to poorly managed COVID-19 contaminated waste; and (b) in the medium-to-long-term phase, the Project will improve backbone SWM infrastructure and service delivery to address the underlying risk factors leading to recurring emergency flooding situations.

Principles and Objectives for Resettlement Preparation and Implementation

The Resettlement Framework (RF) defines the legal and policy framework, eligibility criteria and entitlements for affected persons (APs) to ensure fair and timely compensation, relocation and rehabilitation, grievance redress as well as monitoring and reporting. While the detailed scope of all subprojects of the identified components have not yet been defined, it is anticipated that the proposed investment in targeted districts and towns of Karachi will not require any land acquisition. This RF, prepared and endorsed by the Implementing Agencies (IAs), fulfills World Bank ESS5 requirements pertaining to resettlement policy, principles, objectives and implementation procedures and complies with pertinent national laws and regulations.

Social Context and Baseline Conditions

Karachi is the largest and most populous city in Pakistan and 7th largest megacity in the world. According to the 2017 census the population of Karachi was around 16 million, growing at a rate of about 2.49 percent per year. Karachi's population is a diverse mix of various ethnic groups. Karachi stands at number three among all districts of the country in terms of having the least poverty. The metropolis has a poverty ratio of 4.5% on the Multidimensional Poverty Index (MPI). The incidence of poverty varies among the administrative subdivisions within the metropolis. There is a large number of slums in Karachi and it is estimated that 50 percent of Karachi's population lives in informal settlements of various types.

Process for Preparing and Approving Resettlement Plans

Preparation of Resettlement Plan (RP) for each subproject with resettlement impacts will require a detailed social impact assessment which will be initiated at early stage as part of planning and design of all subprojects. The social impacts assessment will include initial impact assessment, screening of subprojects, preparation of inventory of lost assets followed by a detailed measurement survey and census of APs, and valuation of lost assets. The results of the involuntary resettlement (IR) and Social Impact Assessment will be presented in aggregate form in the subproject RP, and impacts inventory linked to respective APs will be annexed in the RP document. The census inventory of lost assets as well as socio-economic base line of APs will be consolidated and computerized in a database form for each subproject RP.

Estimated Displacement Impacts

The social risks associated with the project are assessed as *High*. No private land acquisition is planned or anticipated. Under Component 2, a major risk of potential resettlement of, and/or livelihood impacts on, squatters settled at the Jam Chakro dumpsite, a community of around four hundred households (HHs). There may be additional risks of resettlement (generally estimated to be of a smaller scale compared to Jam Chakro) in case squatters are settled on and/or encroachers have extended onto the land for transfer stations, new landfill (e.g. at Dhabeji), or treatment infrastructure for non-municipal waste streams.

Under Component 1, cleaning the drains/*nullahs* does not involve any removal of encroachment from the *nullahs*. However, there is a moderate risk of some inadvertent damage to structures (established for livelihood purposes) that may have extended/encroached onto *nullahs*. Removal of material from the *nullahs* to the temporary storage cell may also pose health and safety risks to communities living near *nullahs* (due to spillage around their holdings) and along the transport routes.

Eligibility Criteria for Defining Various Categories of Displaced Persons

APs losing structures (residential or commercial), assets, or income, are entitled for compensation and rehabilitation subsidies, including a relocation subsidy, and a business losses allowance. Those informal

land users without traditional/recognizable rights and encroachers losing land, will not be entitled to land compensation but will be provided compensation for their assets including structures, businesses and resettlement and rehabilitation assistance as per the entitlement matrix prepared for this RF.

Legal and Policy Framework

This RF is designed per the regulatory framework of Pakistan and the World Bank's Environment and Social Framework (ESF) performance standards, specifically ESS 5. The primary objective of ESS 5 is to ensure that project affected persons (APs) are assisted to improve, or as a very minimum restore, their former living standards, income earning capacity, and production levels. However, the country's regulation, particularly the Land Acquisition Act (LAA) does not fully recognize resettlement and rehabilitation of the APs. To bridge such gaps, resettlement principles were developed for the Project.

This is an early draft RF which is based on information available at the time of project appraisal. This draft will be updated, on the basis of further assessment and additional information, cleared from the Bank and disclosed within 60 days of project effectiveness. The commitment to update and redisclose the RF is included in the ESCP.

Methods of Valuing Affected Assets

Houses and other structures will be valued at replacement cost based on construction type and size of the affected structure and prevalent labor cost in the area. No deductions will be made for depreciation, salvageable materials or transaction costs and taxes. Rates will be evaluated by a valuation committee including representatives of the IA, APs, and relevant line department to determine replacement cost.

Rehabilitation or replacement of affected structures and utilities (i.e. schools, mosques, etc.) to pre-Project level will be ensured.

Organizational Procedures for Delivery of Compensation and Resettlement Assistance

The Local Government Department of the Government of Sindh will be the concerned line department for the investment program and provide strategic oversight and direction. Project implementation will be carried out by Sindh Solid Waste Management Board (SSWMB) through an independent PIU – SWEEP. SSWMB will coordinate for all the activities with the Project Implementation Unit (PIU). The PIU will be headed by a Project Director (PD) and have technical staff for carrying out core functions of the project. The Competitive and Livable City of Karachi project's Project Implementation Unit established under the Local Government Department – the CLICK PIU (LGD) under an administrative arrangement will facilitate PIU-SWEEP for emergency nullah cleaning – with support from KMC – and for remaining activities under Component 1 until the approval of PC-1 and establishment of the proper PIU for SWEEP Project with dedicated staffing.

All resettlement planning and implementation tasks will be handled by an Environment and Social Cell (ESC) in the PIU under SSWMB, headed by the Project Director. The ESC will have resettlement, social development (for gender and community engagement), environment, and health and safety specialists.

Implementation Process for Resettlement Implementation and Civil Works

Civil works shall commence, and contractors mobilized only after all APs confirm that full compensation has been received, that they shall not be affected or displaced due to the scheduled works, and IA has taken over the site.

Grievance Redress Mechanism

A two- tiered Grievance Redress Mechanism (GRM) will be set up under the PIU to address grievances arising from project activities, including any resettlement issues. The purpose of the GRM is to receive, review and resolve grievances from APs and facilitate the fair implementation of this RF and subproject RPs. Grievances related to GBV will be handled as a separate category within the GRM system.

Arrangement of Resettlement Funding

Allocation and provision of financial resources is the responsibility of the IA for effective management of project resettlement requirements, including clearance of public land specified for civil works/construction from encumbrances, establishment of relocation/resettlement sites, payment of compensation for acquired assets, relocation and resettlement costs, and implementation of income restoration measures, etc.

Consultation with Key Stakeholders

Limited stakeholder consultations were carried out due to COVID-19 crisis with community living within the disposal site at Jam Chakro. The IA will devise and implement a comprehensive consultation, participation and information disclosure strategy to ensure that stakeholders, directly or indirectly involved in the project – including APs, marginalized/vulnerable beneficiary groups, government officials and civil society, for subprojects identified to have involuntary resettlement impact – are meaningfully consulted during the entire project cycle. The World Bank’s technical note on public consultations in context of limitation on public meetings will be used as guidance for organising public consultations.¹ The RF will be disclosed on the World Bank and IA’s websites by appraisal of the project.

Monitoring, Evaluation and Reporting

Resettlement tasks will be monitored internally and externally (by independent or third-party monitors). Internal monitoring will include day to day tracking of progress about resettlement planning and implementation activities, including compensation payments, rehabilitation and income restoration measures implemented. The PIU will be responsible for internal monitoring and sharing RP implementation progress, and periodic monitoring, reports with the IA and the World Bank.

¹ Technical Note: Public Consultations and Stakeholder Engagement in WB-supported operations when there are constraints on conducting public meetings (March 20, 2020)
<https://worldbankgroup.sharepoint.com/sites/wbunits/opcs/Knowledge%20Base/Public%20Consultations%20in%20WB%20Operations.pdf>

1. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

1.1 Context

The World Bank is assisting the Government of Sindh (GoS) to prepare the proposed Sindh Waste Emergency and Efficiency Project (SWEEP), which aims to address the flooding and COVID-19 emergency, and to improve the provision of solid waste management services in Karachi.

1.2 Description of the Proposed Project Components

The proposed project will finance interventions that will be implemented over two phases: (a) in the immediate emergency response phase, activities will aim to mitigate (i) high flooding risks linked to the 2020 monsoon and caused by accumulation of solid waste in the city's natural drainage channels (nullahs²), as well as (ii) public health risks caused by exposure to poorly managed COVID-19 contaminated waste; and (b) in the medium-to-long-term phase, the Project will improve backbone SWM infrastructure and service delivery to address the underlying risk factors leading to recurring emergency flooding situations.

1.2.1 Component 1: Immediate Emergency Response Interventions

Interventions under this component will aim at mitigating high risks from flooding during the 2020 monsoon. Emergency interventions under SWEEP will support cleaning of nullahs by removing waste obstructing the flow of water and restore drainage capacity, construction of a temporary storage cell at the Jam Chakro disposal site for waste cleared from nullahs, and communication and outreach activities to reduce dumping of waste into nullahs.

1.2.2 Component 2: Development of SWM Backbone Infrastructure

This component will finance backbone infrastructure for the SWM sector, essential to the restoration and improvement of primary SWM functions in Karachi from collection to disposal. Key investments include the construction of new sanitary disposal cell within the Jam Chakro dump site, construction/ upgrading of up to four transfer stations, retrofitting of existing and construction of new *kachra kundis*, development of advanced waste treatment solutions – including modern landfilling capacity and associated infrastructure, and development of non-municipal waste management solutions – and provision of equipment and machinery to local councils and the Sindh Solid Waste Management Board (SSWMB). The project uses a framework approach to design and develop subprojects under Component 2.

1.2.3 Component 3: Project Management and Implementation Support

The component will support resourcing the PIU for managing procurements, contract supervision, and oversight of infrastructure investments, such as: (a) consultants for feasibility studies, environment and social impact assessments, engineering design and supervision, and third party monitoring; (b) contractors for infrastructure works; and (c) skilling and capacity building requirements of SSWMB's staff and engineers, related to operations and maintenance of infrastructure commissioned under SWEEP, per international standards and design specifications.

1.3 Need for Resettlement Policy Framework

This project does not involve any private land acquisition. However, there may be a potential need for resettlement of, and/or livelihood impacts on, squatters and/or encroachers. This RF has been developed for subprojects that may entail involuntary resettlement and/or impact on livelihood (ESS5). Apart from meeting World Bank requirements, the RF defines the legal and policy framework, eligibility criteria and entitlements for project affected persons (APs) and, as required, to ensure livelihood restoration, relocation and rehabilitation. As the exact location and design of most of the components are not known by project appraisal hence, in line with ESS5, a RF has been prepared. During implementation, once the subprojects and/or project components are designed and specific information becomes available, the RF will be expanded into RPs, as required, proportionate to potential risks and impacts applicable to activities requiring resettlement.

² 'Nullahs', or natural drainage streams, constitute the primary network of the urban stormwater drainage system in Karachi.

2. PRINCIPLES AND OBJECTIVES OF RESETTLEMENT PREPERATION AND IMPLEMENTATION

2.1 The Resettlement Framework (RF)

This RF was prepared by the Sindh Solid Waste Management Board (SSWMB) and is designed in accordance with the World Bank Policy under ESF and applicable laws and regulations of Pakistan and the Sindh Province. It sets out policy and operational guidelines pertaining to resettlement policy, principles, objectives and implementation procedures. The legal, institutional and implementation framework for the compensation of lost assets, livelihoods, community property and the resettlement and rehabilitation of project affected people are outlined. In particular, the eligibility criteria for APs, entitlements, modes of compensation and rehabilitation, participation and consultation procedures and grievance redress mechanisms are defined.

This is an early draft RF which is based on information available at the time of project appraisal. This draft will be updated on the basis of further assessment and additional information. The updated RF – including inter alia, a Livelihood Restoration Framework (LRF) – will be disclosed within 60 days of project effectiveness after review and clearance by the World Bank. The commitment to update and redisclose the RF is included in the ESCP.

In accordance with ESS5, a RP is required for each subproject involving resettlement irrespective of scale and magnitude of impacts. The RP will cover economic and physical impacts that result from the subproject and establish the detailed compensation and administration budgets, as well as an implementation schedule linking resettlement tasks to the inception of civil works. The RPs will be prepared in accordance with the principles included in this RF.

2.1.1 Principles and Objectives

ESS5 recognizes that project-related land acquisition or restrictions on land use can have adverse impacts on communities and persons. Project-related land acquisition or restrictions on land use may cause physical displacement (relocation, loss of residential land or loss of shelter), economic displacement, leading to loss of income sources or other means of livelihood), or both. In line with ESS5³, the principles and objectives of this RF are to:

- i. avoid involuntary resettlement or, when unavoidable, minimize involuntary resettlement by exploring project design alternatives.
- ii. mitigate unavoidable adverse social and economic impacts from restrictions on land use by a) providing timely compensation for loss of assets at replacement cost, and b) assisting displaced persons in their efforts to improve, or at least restore, their livelihoods and living standards, in real terms, to pre-displacement levels or to levels prevailing prior to the beginning of project implementation, whichever is higher.
- iii. establish entitlements of all categories of affected persons (Aps), for both physical displacement and livelihood impacts, and to ensure that these are provided in a transparent, consistent, and equitable manner.
- iv. pay particular attention to gender aspects and the needs of vulnerable segments of communities
- v. ensure that resettlement activities are planned and implemented with appropriate disclosure of information, meaningful consultation, and the informed participation of those affected.
- vi. Institute and ensure access to grievance redress mechanism throughout the planning and implementation of the resettlement process

³ For further details on ESS5 refer to the ESF

<http://pubdocs.worldbank.org/en/837721522762050108/Environmental-and-Social-Framework.pdf>

3. SOCIAL CONTEXT AND BASELINE CONDITIONS

3.1 Overview

Karachi is the capital of the province of Sindh, a dynamic, thriving and multifaceted megacity spreading over 3,530 square kilometers. Karachi is the largest and most populous city in Pakistan and 7th largest megacity in the world. According to the 2017 census the population of Karachi was around 16 million, growing at a rate of about 2.49 percent per year. Karachi Division has six districts, and of these, East, West and Malir report substantially higher annual growth rates and high sex ratios indicating that there has been substantial in-migration to these districts. Between 1951 and 2017, Karachi has grown over 13 times, slightly higher than the urban growth in Pakistan.

Karachi's population is a diverse mix of various ethnic groups. The city has experienced an influx of immigrants, which has changed its demographics considerably, and has also impacted the balance of power between ethnic groups leading to a host of social issues. Karachi stands at number three among all the districts of the country in terms of having the least poverty. The metropolis has a poverty ratio of 4.5% on the Multidimensional Poverty Index (MPI). The incidence of poverty varies among the 18 towns and the cantonment areas within the metropolis. According to one estimate, there are 600 slums in Karachi and 50 percent of Karachi's population lives in informal settlements of various types.

Karachi is the financial capital of Pakistan and generates a significant part of the total national revenue. At the provincial level, the city's share of provincial tax receipts is as high as 70%. Karachi's large-scale industrial sector employed 72.7% of the labor force and produced 74.8% of the total large-scale output of the province. In 2017, Karachi's literacy rate was 87 percent and in the national ranking Karachi stood at 59 in terms of school infrastructure and availability of facilities. Overall literacy rate in informal settlements or *katchi abadis* was 71 per cent with a significant gender gap of 76 per cent for males and 66 per cent for females. In comparison to the rest of Pakistan, Karachi has a high HDI and is number four in the national HDI ranking. The current infant mortality rate under 5 years [per 1000 live births] has improved to 59 and the maternal mortality to 180.

As one of Pakistan's fastest growing metropolises, Karachi is challenged by increasing demand for water and sanitation, solid waste management, storm water drainage and other municipal services, particularly in *katchi abadis* which face severe challenges for service delivery. The key issue in the drainage sector include inadequate storm water drainage infrastructure, encroachments by unplanned low-income settlements along drainage channels, dumping of uncollected solid waste into drains, and the improvised use of stormwater drains for transporting wastewater. Urban flooding a serious issue directly affecting tens of thousands and possibly affecting millions indirectly. Solid waste management (SWM) has become a challenge for city authorities, which struggle to deal with escalating waste production. Statistics indicate that Karachi generates at least 12,000 tons of solid waste daily. Inadequate SWM is causing the spread of infectious diseases and environmental pollution. Due to inadequate solid waste collection, transfer and disposal in the city, a substantial part of the waste is generally thrown in nearby drains, resulting in their clogging and higher flooding risk. Sustained exposure to contaminated and stagnant waters results in significant increase in numbers of people affected by water-borne or insect-borne diseases.

3.2 Proposed Subproject Sites

In view of preliminary information available from the implementing agencies (IAs), social baseline conditions of the following potential subproject sites are provided below.

3.2.1 Jam Chakro Dumpsite

Jam Chakro is located in Bund Murad, Mangho Pir, District Council Gadap Town and District Karachi West. The total land area at Jam Chakro disposal site is 500 acres. At the dumping site, there are two settlements, Umar Goth and Ibrahim Goth. According to a preliminary census survey of HHs carried out in June 2020, there are approximately four hundred households at site. A sizable number of people residing in the two

settlements are religious minorities and belong to the Hindu community. Most community members are uneducated.

The majority of people living at Jam Chakro, including women, are involved in waste picking for purposes of livelihood. A small percentage also work as daily wage labor. Almost all the households fall below the poverty line. Drinking water is not available in adequate quantity as the ground water in the area is brackish. In the project area people mostly use canal water which is brought from the Hub Canal for drinking purpose and a few households purchase water supplied through the tankers which is more costly. There is a small secondary school in the area, established by a welfare trust, which has been functioning for almost 12 years. The communities also have a graveyard situated near the settlement.

3.2.2 *Kachra kundis* in Karachi City

The project interventions also include construction and rehabilitation of new and existing *kachra kundis* (communal waste collection points) respectively. The locations of these *kachra kundis* are not known yet. Waste picking at these points is done by vulnerable and poor groups, also including women and children. The waste pickers are mobile and move along different collection points to recover recyclable material which they take to commonly owned yards for further processing.

3.2.3 Construction/Upgrading of Transfer Facilities

The project will finance the construction of modern transfer stations. The number and location will be determined based on the strategic SWM plan and on land availability.

3.2.4 Proposed Waste Treatment Plant in Dhabeji

A site with a total area of 3,000 acres has been designated by the GoS in Dhabeji, about 60 km east of Karachi, for the development of waste treatment activities. This land is owned by the GoS and is currently not under use. The project will support the design and construction of an integrated facility for treating municipal waste at Dhabeji, consistent with the Integrated Karachi SWM Strategy that will be developed under CLICK. Subproject area of impact will depend on design of the facility and is expected to be much smaller than the overall government land holding at this site. If the ESIA for this subproject indicates that there is encumbrance on the land required for the subproject, a detailed assessment will be done as part of the preparation of a corresponding RP.

3.2.5 Development of solutions to improve treatment of non-municipal waste streams

The project will potentially support design and development of solutions to improve treatment of non-municipal waste streams such as medical, industrial, or construction waste. This will involve: a) an assessment of existing systems for collection, transport and disposal of various waste streams; b) identification of key gaps to be addressed through improving processes, investments, and technological solutions; c) development of service improvement plans needed to build fully functional solutions for specific streams; and d) identification of priority investments, including technical specifications for transport and disposal solutions, optimal locations for facilities, contractual arrangements, et al. The project will support implementation of the plans through financing priority investments.

4. PROCESS FOR PREPARING AND APPROVING RPs

4.1 Social Impact Assessment

Preparation of RP for each subproject with resettlement impacts under the subproject will require a detailed social impact assessment which will be initiated at early stage as part of planning and design of all subprojects to be implemented. The social impacts assessment will include initial social impact assessment, social screening of subprojects, a detailed measurement survey (DMS), census of APs, a socio-economic survey (SES), and valuation of lost assets (VLA). The results of the Social Impact Assessment will be presented in aggregate form in the subproject RPs, and impacts inventory linked to respective APs will be annexed in the RP document.

4.1.1 Initial Screening Exercise

Following the decision that the subproject to be financed under SWEEP, an initial impact assessment will be carried out as a screening exercise to determine potential social impacts for RP preparation, implementation and monitoring requirements based on impact significance. The RP will be detailed and comprehensive and will cover all affected persons and address all impacts in line with the project RF.

4.1.2 Census Survey

The census survey will be conducted for a 100 percent of affected households. The purpose of the survey is to determine who is entitled to compensation, assistance, and other benefits. The inventory of affected assets and other losses will be itemized by enumerating losses of each category of structure, and other assets, which will help in providing compensation for the lost assets. For structures, type, age, affected area, utility connections, building materials, and area of building will be recorded. Additional information is required for income losses, affected public utilities, preferences for relocation, loss of cultural and religious properties, and territorial claims by any ethnic group.

4.1.3 Baseline Socioeconomic Profile

The 100 percent census survey of APs, including women, will also provide a detailed socio-economic profile of APs. The information gathered will focus on: (i) household composition and demography; (ii) education; (iii) livelihood patterns; (iv) ownership pattern of the households; (v) AP income levels and expenditure patterns; (vi) availability of social services in project areas; (vii) APs views on the subproject and various resettlement and rehabilitation options; (viii) specific impacts on the poor, women and other vulnerable groups. In addition to the demographic and socio-economic household level baseline data, the survey will be used as a benchmark for monitoring the socio-economic status of APs.

4.1.4 Detailed Measurement Survey

A detailed measurement survey (DMS) will be carried out with participation of APs for identifying and providing the measurement of the dimensions and quantities of all affected assets, including, as applicable, land (residential), buildings, communal/public or cultural/religious facilities, incomes and wages, will be the basis of the impacts assessment will be included in the RP. The pricing for loss of houses and structures will be based on precise measurement and record of type, quality and measurement of materials and will be calculated based on replacement cost, i.e., cost of new building materials and labor. The data gathered for the detailed measurement survey will be accompanied by the preparation of accurate lists of APs, as the basis for the preparation of the AP census and socio-economic survey.

4.1.5 Screening of Vulnerable Households

During the census survey vulnerable groups, including but not limited to, female headed households, disabled, elderly persons and persons below the poverty line will be screened to ensure that assistance is provided to those who are genuinely in need to reduce vulnerability and improve their living standards.

4.1.6 Resettlement Database

Once DMS and valuation of assets is completed, the APs census data will be updated by incorporating entitled compensation costs for the acquired assets and applicable relocation, rehabilitation and income restoration costs applicable against each acquired asset and payable to the respective APs. The updated census inventory of lost assets as well as socio-economic base line of APs will be consolidated and computerized in a database form for each subproject RP. This database will be used as base line for subsequent implementation and monitoring of subproject RPs. This database will be kept updated by incorporating information on compensation payment against each paid AP for day to day tracking of RP implementation progress and generating periodic RP implementation progress and social monitoring reports to facilitate efficient safeguards management and monitoring of RP implementation progress.

4.2 Valuation of Land and other Assets

As a part of the resettlement planning process, an assessment of replacement costs or asset valuation will be carried out through a committee including representatives of the IA, APs and relevant line department. The census will be based on preliminary engineering/technical designs of the project. The census data will be updated once the final and detailed engineering designs are completed.

4.3 Information Dissemination Relating to IR and Mitigation Measures

The EA will disseminate all information relevant to the involuntary resettlement impacts that include the orientation on potential social and environment impacts of the project, results of social impact assessment, measures to mitigate the impact, meaningful consultations, eligibility, entitlements, cut-off-date, RP disclosure, grievance redressal mechanism, unit costs for compensation, resettlement and rehabilitation assistance, RP implementation procedures, institutional responsibilities of RAP implementation, time frames, cost estimates, monitoring, and the resettlement planning process. During resettlement plan preparation, resettlement information will be disclosed to all APs in their own language, and their views and opinions will be taken into consideration in finalizing the plans.

4.4 RPs Approval, Clearance and Disclosure

Following incorporation of comments from disclosure, the draft RP will be reviewed and approved by the Project Director (PD) of SWEEP. The PD will ensure that the RP complied with the RF and after approval, will submit it to the WB for compliance review with WB policies and procedures prior to providing clearance. The RP will be disclosed prior to the issue of bids for corresponding civil works. The approved RP together with translation in Urdu will be posted on the website of the IAs. The WB will also disclose the RP on its website. The translation of the RP will also include the Cut-off date. This will exclude the cash compensation amounts to be paid to the APs. Any changes to the RP would have to follow the same clearance/ approval procedures and disclosure.

5. ESTIMATED DISPLACEMENT IMPACTS

5.1 Potential Resettlement Impacts

Component 1: Cleaning of nullahs and removal of waste material activities will not involve any resettlement impacts. The IA (SWEEP PIU) agrees that all emergency activities on the *nullahs* will focus on removing solid waste from the drains, and not involve any widening or rehabilitation works. During implementation, *nullahs* will be accessed from points that do not have encroachment issues. In case some locations cannot be accessed and are critical for effective cleaning, manual cleaning will be done at such points. Hence, removal of squatters and other informal settlers will not be included. In the event of any inadvertent damage to structures during the cleaning works; or if manual cleaning is not an option and a certain structures need to be unavoidably removed in order to access a critical location for cleaning, the IA will make and maintain a complete record of such cases/impacts. Most importantly, the location, details of the damage/loss of structures/assets, the identification and contact details of the affected person(s), and photographic/video evidence will be recorded. Such cases will also be recorded by the independent third-party monitoring agency overseeing the emergency works along the *nullahs*. If any such damage is categorized as an impact on livelihood and/or physical displacement (in keeping with ESS5) in the E&S Audit to be done for purposes of retroactive financing for Component 1, compensation for the affected person(s), in accordance with the RF, will be included in the Corrective Action Plan based on the E&S audit findings. The retroactive financing for Component 1 will be approved and made available upon implementation of the E&S Audit Corrective Action Plan, and a commitment in this regard will be recorded in the Environmental and Social Commitment Plan (ESCP) for the project.

Component 2: Under Component 2, the project will not require any private land acquisition. The Jam Chakro dumpsite is owned by the SSWMB. This component will entail potential resettlement and/or livelihood impacts for around four hundred households living at the Jam Chakro dumpsite for almost 3 decades as squatters without legal ownership. These households mostly earn a living from collecting and selling recyclables from the dumpsite. Many of them are women, children, elderly, unemployed, who work under unhealthy conditions with no social protection and often face social exclusion. These informal workers live in makeshift/ improvised shelters on the dumpsite land. They have limited access to basic services, while facing high risks from health and safety hazards. A RP will be required, in accordance with the project RF, to address any resettlement under the subcomponent. The information about the resettlement or adverse economic impacts on affected person if any will be finalised during the preparation of the RP for corresponding civil works at Jam Chakro.

Component 2 also includes the construction of modern transfer station to improve the efficiency of front-end SWM operations is envisaged. The locations of transfer stations have not yet been finalised. These interventions may have limited resettlement impacts and, if so, would be covered under RPs in accordance with the project RF.

Similarly, the project will also finance the development of treatment infrastructure for non-municipal waste streams. The location of this infrastructure is not yet known. However, if required, RPs will be prepared in accordance with the project RF to address any livelihood / physical displacement impacts.

The project will also finance the upgrading of existing *kachra kundis* (communal waste collection points) and the construction of some new points at appropriate locations. Location of interventions will be planned based on need and consultations with nearby residents, particularly in underserved and flood-prone areas, to prevent illegal dumping in the nullahs. No physical displacement risk is associated with the rehabilitation and or construction of *kachra kundis*. A draft Environmental and Social Management Framework (ESMF) will be prepared for the project prior to project approval which will include a preliminary assessment of E&S impacts.

Under Component 2 the project will also support the design and development of waste treatment facilities, likely within a site designated by the GoS in Dhabeji. Subproject area of impact will depend on the design of the facility, and is expected to be much smaller than the overall government land holding of around 3,000 acres, which is reported to be free from all encumbrances. A due diligence of the proposed site will be carried at the detailed design stage before implementation, and if required, RP will be prepared in accordance with the project RF.

The IA agrees that resettlement impacts will be avoided or minimized as far as possible through the selection of design alternatives. The detailed scoping activities will be conducted to avoid all potential resettlement impacts of the subprojects at critical locations. The updated RF will make a further assessment of potential project impacts as required under ESS5 and provide policies for addressing the same and for preparing subproject RPs.

5.2 Gender and Vulnerability Impacts

The following provisions for gender and vulnerable groups are stipulated to guarantee a clear understanding and due consideration of the specific needs and problems of women and vulnerable APs and to provide necessary safeguards during subproject implementation.

- In the design of subprojects particular attention will be paid to the development needs and priorities voiced by women and vulnerable respondents during consultations in all phases of the project.
- The consultation process should ensure that women's perspectives are obtained, and their interests are factored into all aspects of resettlement planning and implementation.
- Access for women and vulnerable APs to project related employment opportunities and targeted needs-based special assistance and provision of alternative and suitable livelihoods will be guaranteed to as far as possible.
- The livelihood planning will provide special assistance to women, minorities or vulnerable groups who may be disadvantaged in securing alternative livelihoods.
- Intra-household gender analysis will be carried out. Women's and men's preferences in terms of compensation mechanisms, e.g. replacement land rather than in cash, shall be explored.
- Women will receive compensation pertaining to their economic activities in their name.
- Resettlement assistance and compensation payments will be issued in the joint names of both spouses or single heads of households as relevant
- Other resettlement assistance, such as skills training, access to credit, and job opportunities, should be equally available to women and adapted to their needs.
- Women will be included in the participation and consultation process in a manner suitable and accessible by women.
- Due consideration will be given to complaints and grievances lodged by women APs.
- The project will also ensure the inclusion of a least one female representative in the Grievance Redress Committee and the inclusion of female staff in the PIU.

6. ELEGIBILITY CRITERIA FOR DEFINING VARIOUS CATEGORIES OF DISPLACED PERSONS

6.1 Compensation Eligibility

Each AP will be enlisted and issued identification as to confirm his/her presence on the proposed site of a subproject prior to the cut-off date at the time of RP implementation. The cut-off date will be disclosed to the APs through consultative meetings, focus group discussions, field surveys and other means of communication including face-to-face communication with communities. The disclosure of cut-off date will be formalized through documentation of consultation meetings and disclosure reports.

6.1.1 Cut-off Date

The eligibility for compensation will be limited to the IA announced cut-off date immediately prior to the start of the census for each subproject that involves resettlement impacts. The cut-off date shall be set and announced to prevent influx of outsiders and to avoid false and frivolous claims for compensation, relocation and rehabilitation entitlements. Information regarding the cut-off date will be well documented and will be disseminated throughout the project area at regular intervals in written and (as appropriate) nonwritten forms and in relevant local languages. This will include posted warnings that persons settling in the project area after the cut-off date may be subject to removal.

6.1.2 Eligibility

In line with the laws and regulations of Pakistan and ESS5, all resettlement tasks of the project will be implemented in accordance with the eligibility and entitlement framework detailed in the entitlement matrix (Section 6.5). Each subproject RP will list the actual compensation measures adopted on the basis of the entitlements stipulated in the RF. People affected by a subproject under the SWEEP are eligible for resettlement compensation or at least rehabilitation entitlements for their loss of assets and incomes as follows:

- i. Who have formal legal rights to land or assets;
- ii. Who do not have formal legal rights to land or assets, but have a claim to land or assets that is recognized or recognizable under national law; or,
- iii. Who have no recognizable legal right or claim to the land or assets they occupy or use.

The IA is not required to compensate or assist those who encroach on the project area after the cut-off date for eligibility, provided the cut-off date has been clearly established and made public.

6.2 Entitlements

The following entitlements are stipulated for the compensation of lost structures and utilities and livelihoods, as well as for special provisions for women and other vulnerable APs. The valuation methodology to be used will be based on the replacement costs (market rate plus transaction costs)

6.2.1 Residential and commercial structures

The loss of residential, commercial structures and utilities including, among others, houses, business premises will be compensated as follows:

- i. House for house compensation as per the industry standards, in line with international good practice is the preferred option, as it has significant advantages in that it reduces the chance of displaced people squandering their compensation on items that will not provide them with an alternative housing facility. In this regard non-titled squatters, most preferably, will be compensated through fully titled and registered adequate housing on secured tenure basis in a resettlement site, if one is developed for the project, or another location agreeable to the AP;

OR

In the event provision of housing is not feasible (e.g. due to non-availability of land, economic constraints etc.): for the loss of a structure or utility non-titled owners, including encroachers/squatters, would be entitled to cash compensation at the full replacement cost for the affected structure and other fixed assets without deductions for salvageable materials, depreciation and transaction cost.

ii. Owners of affected structures, including encroachers/squatters, will also be allowed to take and reuse salvageable materials for building or rehabilitation of structures.

6.2.2 Communal, public and cultural structures and utilities

For the loss of communal, public and cultural structures and utilities, including, schools, mosques, graveyards and other affected assets, will be restored at the relocation sites. The relevant government department is to be informed and involved as applicable. All relocation and rehabilitation provisions of this RF are applicable to public services and facilities.

6.2.3 Livelihood restoration

As discussed earlier, the project involves significant impacts on livelihoods. A concrete Livelihood Restoration Framework for the preparation of Livelihood Restoration Plans (LRPs) will be included in the update version of the RF. This framework will include measures to allow all affected persons, who experience adverse livelihood impacts, to be provided opportunities to improve, or at least restore, their means of income-earning capacity, production levels, and standards of living. Cash assistance alone will not be adopted (unless there is justification in certain cases, acceptable to the Bank) as it is established that cash assistance alone frequently fails to provide affected persons with the productive means or skills to restore livelihoods. Transitional support will be provided as necessary to all economically displaced persons, based on a reasonable estimate of the time required to restore their income-earning capacity, production levels, and standards of living. Measures shall be taken that any investment intervention under the project may give all possible opportunity of employment to vulnerable groups whose income is being affected.

Particular attention will be paid to gender aspects and the needs of vulnerable segments of communities who may be disadvantaged in securing alternative livelihoods, and a vulnerability allowance will be determined and provided to such groups. For the purposes of the project, vulnerable groups may comprise, inter alia: identified APs earning less than the minimum wage for unskilled workers in the province (as determined by the Government of Sindh); women-headed households; the elderly; differently-abled; working children and adolescents; or any other APs as identified through the ESIA. This categorization will be refined and finalized, in light of further assessment, when the RF is updated.

All able-bodied poor and vulnerable APs, especially women, will be given priority for employment in long-term waste collection, material recovery, waste treatment or waste disposal operations managed by the SSWMB, either directly or through contractors, and will be provided the requisite training to avail such opportunities. Such longer-term employment may also be in lieu of compensation for livelihood impacts and/or vulnerability allowance. In addition, provision related to preference for project-related employment during the construction phase will be reflected in the civil works contracts as well as the agreements between the project IAs and the WB.

Un-interrupted access to business premises in the project area (e.g. during construction activity) will be ensured in consultation with the APs. If this cannot be ensured, compensation for temporary loss of livelihood will be provided. Details will be included in the updated RF.

6.2.4 Resettlement and Relocation Assistance

All APs will be provided assistance for relocation and resettlement (as required) to cover cost of transportation, relocation assistance, and security of tenure at relocation sites. The details of such assistance will be defined in the updated RF in light of further assessment.

6.3 Entitlement Matrix

In line with the laws and regulations of Pakistan and the World Bank ESS5, all resettlement tasks of the project will be implemented in accordance with the eligibility and entitlement framework detailed in the **Table 1**. This table will be refined, in light of further assessment in the updated RF. Each subproject RP will list the actual compensation measures adopted on the basis of the entitlements stipulated in the project RF.

Table 1: Eligibility and Compensation Entitlement Matrix

Type of Loss	Specification	Eligibility	Entitlements
1. STRUCTURES			
Residential	Loss of structure	Owner (non-titled land user)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All households will be provided adequate housing according to the national minimum standard/industry standards, or cash compensation at full replacement cost computed at replacement cost (materials, labor, transport and other incidental costs, as required, without deduction of depreciation for age). Right to salvage materials from lost structure. In case of delays, the inflation rate of 10% will be added per annum in the cash compensation.
Business	Loss of structure (e.g. stalls, kiosks, cabins)	Owner (non-titled land user)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Allocation of alternative location comparable to lost location, or cash compensation for self-relocation at replacement cost (labor, materials, transport and other incidental costs, as required, without deduction of depreciation for age). Right to salvage materials from lost structure.
2. RESETTLEMENT & RELOCATION			
Relocation Assistance	All types of structures affected	All eligible APs who need to relocate as a result of losing structures	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The project will provide logistic support to all eligible APs in relocation of affected structures whether project-based relocation or self-relocation as opted by the APs.

Type of Loss	Specification	Eligibility	Entitlements
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> If project-based relocation, APs will be provided with access to civic amenities including electricity, water supply and sewage as well as school and mosque. Relocation assistance details will be refined, in light of further assessment, in the updated RF.
Security of tenure	Replacement structures	All APs who need to relocate as a result of losing structures	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> APs will be relocated to existing developed areas where they will be given replacement homes with full security of tenure.
Transport allowance	All types of structures requiring relocation	All APs required to relocate as a result of losing structures	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> For both residential and commercial structures, the transport allowance will be determined, after further assessment of the situation on ground, in the updated RF
3. LIVELIHOOD RESTORATION			
Businesses	Temporary business interruption due to resettlement or project construction activities	Owner of business (registered, informal)	Requisite compensation to be provided. Details to be determined in light of further assessment in the updated RF
	Permanent business loss due to resettlement	Owner of business (registered, informal)	Requisite livelihood restoration support and transitional support (as required) to be provided. Details to be determined in light of further assessment in the updated RF
Employment/ livelihood	Temporary employment/ livelihood interruption due to resettlement or project construction activities	All laid-off employees of affected businesses, or workers who's access to employment/ livelihood is temporarily interrupted	Requisite compensation to be provided. Details to be determined in light of further assessment in the updated RF
	Permanent employment/ livelihood loss due to resettlement	All laid-off employees of affected businesses, or workers who's access to employment/ livelihood is permanently impacted	Requisite livelihood restoration support and transitional support (as required) to be provided. Details to be determined in light of further assessment in the updated RF
Vulnerable APs	Special provisions	All vulnerable APs, which may include: identified APs earning less than the minimum wage for unskilled workers in the province (as determined by	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> In addition to applicable compensation entitlements for lost assets, livelihood restoration and/or relocation entitlements (to be determined in the updated RF), the

Type of Loss	Specification	Eligibility	Entitlements
		the Government of Sindh); women-headed households; the elderly; differently-abled; working children and adolescents; or any other APs as identified through the ESIA.	vulnerable APs will be provided with: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Vulnerability allowance (to be determined in the updated RF) • Preference for provision of employment in operations managed by SSWMB, as feasible, and requisite skills training to avail such opportunities
4. PUBLIC SERVICES AND FACILITIES			
Loss of public services and facilities	Schools, Madrassa, graveyard etc.	Service provider	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Full restoration at relocation site of lost public services and facilities. • Relocation of graveyard or construction of a boundary wall to confine the graveyard.
5. TREES AND CROPS			
Loss of trees	Affected trees	All APs owning trees (including squatters)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • For timber/ wood trees, the compensation will be at market value of tree's wood content. • Fruit trees: cash compensation based on lost production for the entire period needed to re-establish a tree of equal productivity.
6. UNIDENTIFIED LOSSES			
Any losses identified during implementation	Unanticipated impacts	All APs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Address appropriately during project implementation according to the local legal framework and the World Bank ESF.

6.5.1 Provisions for Women APs

Acquisition of household assets can impact women disproportionately due to their fragile socio-economic status and it could be difficult for them to re-establish their socio-economic activities because of restricted mobility or illiteracy. Although the female household heads or the female having title of the acquired assets are eligible and entitled for compensation and benefits for their lost assets similar as to their male counterparts, but they may need special attention because of lack of resources, educational qualifications, skills, and work experience. To safeguards women needs and interests, following measures will be considered during impact assessment, census of displaced persons, designing rehabilitation/resettlement provisions and preparation of the RP for each subproject under the SWEEP.

- Gender segregated socio-economic baseline and impact inventory linked to the entitled APs will be developed and women shall be compensated for assets in their name, meanwhile identified female headed households (if vulnerable) will be entitled for additional compensation as provided in the subproject RP.

- During census and socio-economic assessment, meaningful consultations will be conducted with displaced women through focus group discussions and individual meetings to identify the concerns and mitigation required in resettlement planning and accordingly the subproject RP will detail the scope of resettlement impact on women and wherever required separate gender action plan will be developed.
- In case of compensation for household assets, efforts will be ensured to pay compensation in the joint accounts (if possible) and in case of provision of replacement asset, i.e., residential unit at resettlement/relocation site, it will be ensured that the provided asset is transferred in the joint ownership of the male and female counterparts of the displaced households; and

Gender sensitive grievance redress system with women participation will be ensured to facilitate the aggrieved women (if any) to lodge complaints and get their concerns resolved.

DRAFT

7 LEGAL AND POLICY FRAMEWORK

7.1 Legal and Policy Framework

This RF is designed based on the regulatory framework of Pakistan's and the World Bank's ESF, specifically ESS5. The primary objective of ESS5 is to ensure that APs are assisted to improve, or as a very minimum restore, their former living standards, income earning capacity, and production levels.

7.1.1 Pakistan's Laws and Regulations

In Pakistan, the governing legislation for land acquisition and compensation is the Land Acquisition Act (LAA) of 1894 with successive amendments, which regulates the land acquisition process and enables the federal and provincial governments to acquire private land for public purposes. Land acquisition is a provincial subject, and each province has its own interpretation of the Act, and some have their own province specific implementation rules.

The law deals with the matters related with acquisition of private land and other immovable properties existing on the land for the public purpose. The public purpose, *inter alia*, includes the construction of development projects of public interest. The LAA specifies a systematic approach for acquiring and compensation of land and other properties for development projects. It stipulates various sections pertaining to notifications, surveys, acquisition, compensation and apportionment awards and disputes resolution, penalties and exemptions.

The LAA prescribes provisions for fair and adequate compensation for land acquired involuntarily, however, its enforcement marred by many lacunas due to the bureaucratic ineptness and the whole process from notification to compensation and grievance resolution often encumbered with inordinate delays and under the guise of eminent domain the state coercively acquires the citizens property and agonizing and pushing them in impoverishment with a little recourse. In addition, the LAA procedures do not entail the consultation and participation of affected people but leave the entire process to the discretion of the revenue department and implementing agency.

The framework of the LAA is generally considered to be constricted in scope and inadequately take into account the rehabilitation and resettlement of displaced populations and restoration of their livelihoods. The LAA also does not specifically provide any assistance for the poor, vulnerable or severely APs, nor does it cover for livelihood losses or resettlement costs for rehabilitation. Generally, it is limited to a cash compensation policy for the acquisition of land and built-up property, and damage to other assets such as crops, trees, and infrastructure.

A National Resettlement Policy and Resettlement Ordinance with a wider scope of eligibility and entitlements had been drafted in 2002. However, the national policy and ordinance were not officially approved, notified and enacted and hence, at present there is no law for resettlement and rehabilitation in Pakistan. In order to fill the vacuum, some transient measure are taken to compensate adversely affected non-titled people, non-registered tenants, businesses and wage workers under project specific arrangements for their rehabilitation, payment of resettlement costs and assistance for livelihood restoration.

For different range of infrastructure development functions, land acquisition laws are applied. LAA allows the various government departments and authorities to apply to relevant Boards of Revenue or other authorities for acquisition of land for public interest projects.

7.1.2 World Bank ESS5 and Resettlement Principles

Under the ESF, the World Bank has adopted ESS5 to address land acquisition, restrictions on land use, and involuntary resettlement impacts. The objectives of ESS5 are to avoid involuntary resettlement wherever possible; to minimize involuntary resettlement by exploring project and design alternatives; to enhance, or at least restore, the livelihoods of all displaced persons in real terms relative to pre-project levels; and to improve the standards of living of the displaced poor and other vulnerable groups.

The ESS5 covers physical displacement (relocation, loss of residential land, or loss of shelter) and economic displacement (loss of land, assets, access to assets, income sources, or means of livelihoods) as a result of (i) involuntary acquisition of land, or (ii) involuntary restrictions on land use or on access to legally designated parks and protected areas. The important elements of ESS 5 are: (i) compensation at replacement cost for lost assets, livelihood, and income prior to displacement; (ii) assistance for relocation, including provision of relocation sites with appropriate facilities and services; and (iii) assistance for rehabilitation to achieve at least the same level of well-being with the project as without it. The operational policy gives special attention to poor and vulnerable households to ensure their improved well-being as a result of project interventions. To integrate these key aspects an Entitlement Matrix was prepared as part of the RF (**Section 6.5**).

7.2 Bridging Gaps and Resettlement Principles Applicable for the Project

ESS5 AND LAND ACQUISITION ACT 1895			
ESS	Relevant Law	Gap	Gap filling measures in RF
Deals with matters related to land acquisition, restrictions on land use and involuntary resettlement	The Land Acquisition Act 1894 deals with the matters related with acquisition of private land and other immovable properties existing on the land for the public purpose	The LAA, in comparison to the requirements of ESS-5, does not adequately take into account the resettlement and rehabilitation of displaced populations. A key difference is that the absence of a formal legal title is no bar to WB policy entitlements, while in the LAA title is a requirement. Coverage of LAA also does not provide any assistance for the poor and vulnerable APs, livelihood losses or resettlement and rehabilitation costs. Generally, it mainly covers cash compensation for the acquisition of land and built-up property, and damage to other assets such as crops, trees, and infrastructure.	To bridge the gap between current legal principles and practices and the policy requirements of the World Bank, to facilitate the common objective of rehabilitation and to avoid differential ad hoc arrangements for the various subprojects, the IAs drafted this RF for the Project with the endorsement of the Executing Agency. Thereby, a commitment to the following principles is made: The objective of the resettlement framework is to clarify resettlement principles, organizational arrangements and design criteria which will be applied to project components and/or subprojects that will be prepared during project implementation. The resettlement principles applicable to the project are provided as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. All affected assets will be compensated at replacement cost. ii. All APs losing their residential structures and/or livelihood will be compensated in accordance with relevant items in the eligibility and entitlement matrix.

			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> iii. APs will be included in the resettlement process through community consultation and participation. iv. All relevant resettlement information will be publicly disclosed before final decisions on subproject measures, including RPs, are made. v. An accessible grievance redress mechanism will be instituted. vi. Physical project implementation works will not commence until all compensation and rehabilitation measures of a subproject are completed.
--	--	--	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

This section will be elaborated further in the updated RF

7.3 Change of Subproject Scope or identification of Unanticipated Impacts

In case of change in scope of Project, or unanticipated impacts identified during subproject implementation, which are not covered under the eligibility and entitlement provisions of this RF, additional eligibility and entitlement provisions will be determined in accordance with the resettlement requirements of the World Bank’s ESS5 and the applicable legal framework of Pakistan. Accordingly, the RF will be updated, and government-endorsed and World Bank-cleared updated RF shall be disclosed on the World Bank and IA websites. Based on updated RF, specific subproject RPs will be updated with new eligibility and entitlement provisions on account of unidentified impacts and losses under any subprojects and the concerned displaced persons of such subprojects will be consulted and on new entitlement and RP provisions will be disclosed to them. In the first instance, the RF will be updated based on further assessment, consulted on, reviewed and cleared by the Bank, and redisclosed, within 60 days of project effectiveness.

8 METHODS OF VALUING AFFECTED ASSETS

8.1 Valuation of Lost Affected Assets

8.1.1 Temporary occupation of land

Temporary occupation of land, if required for project contractors' facilities like camps sites, stack yards, etc., will be through term lease agreement between the civil works contractor and landowners. The Contractor will directly negotiate with the respective landowners to agree on terms and conditions of leasing arrangement for temporary occupation of land and accordingly a lease agreement can be signed between the contractor and the respective landowners. However, the PIU will ensure the lease terms are judicious and cover provisions on restoration of land to its original use, if it is not otherwise agreed between the contractor and the landowners. In case the land is required temporarily for constructions of diversions, the PIU can itself procure occupation of such land on a termed lease through direct negotiations with the landowners. In either case the temporary occupation term will not exceed three years and the landowners will be provided with the agreed lease money and incidental land restoration costs to restore the land to its original use. The provisions on establishment of campsites, stake yards and temporary diversions will be included in the ESMP prepared for the project and shall be monitored accordingly.

8.1.2 Affected Assets

Houses and other structures will be valued at replacement cost based on construction type and size of the affected structure and prevalent labor cost in the area. No deductions will be made for depreciation, salvageable materials or transaction costs and taxes. Rates will be evaluated by a valuation committee including representatives of the IA, APs, and relevant line department to determine replacement cost.

Rehabilitation or replacement of affected structures and utilities (i.e. schools, mosques, etc.) to pre-Project level will be ensured.

9 ORGANIZATIONAL PROCEDURES FOR DELIVERY OF COMPENSATION AND RESETTLEMENT ASSISTANCE

9.1 Institutional Roles and Responsibilities

The following primary institutions will be involved in resettlement activities.

The Local Government, Housing and Town Planning Department (LGD) is the concerned line department for the project. LGD has also been implementing of Competitive and Livable City of Karachi (CLICK) project supported by the World Bank. LGD will provide strategic oversight and direction to the investment program.

The project implementation will be carried out by the Sindh Solid Waste Management Board (SSWMB).

The SSWMB as the IA has the overall responsibility for the day-to-day implementation of sub-projects. All resettlement related tasks will be handled by an Environment and Social Cell (ESC) within the SSWMB's PIU, headed by the Project Director, who directs and supervises ESC in charge of all resettlement activities for an Implementing Department at the sub-project level. The ESC will have social and resettlement specialists to undertake the social and resettlement related preparation tasks for subprojects, including scoping, social impact assessment, RP preparation and implementation.

The following institutional actors have oversight or supportive functions:

9.2 Project Implementation Unit (PIU)

At Project level, SSWMB will exercise its functions through a PIU. The PIU will be responsible for general project execution of the project and streamline the safeguards related tasks of different subproject headed by the Project Director (PD). The PIU is responsible to ensure compliance with the national as well as WB environmental and social safeguard requirements including preparation of RPs and other management plans.

The PD will be responsible for implementing the safeguards instruments for all subprojects and for maintaining regular contact with local community and authorities. The PIU will collect information and progress on social safeguards compliance through ESC will be established at Project Implementation Unit (PIU), which will be tasked with day-to-day project related activities at project and subproject level.

For the purpose of this Project the PIU was established with a view to serve as a central unit for providing technical backstopping with regards to safeguards management for all subprojects and has the overall responsibility for planning, implementation and supervision of safeguard functions described in this RF of the investment program.

The PIU will keep a close liaison with the World Bank safeguards team to seek clarity and guidance on safeguards requirements of the program and will oversee the supervisory consultants for preparation of safeguard documents. PIU will ensure quality of safeguards documents prepared by the consultants and shall endorse all safeguards related documents to World Bank for review, clearance and disclosure. The role of PIU will include.

- Coordinate with the provincial governments, Planning & Development Department, Board of Revenue;
- Coordinate with the supervisory consultants and keep an oversight to facilitate them during impact assessment, census and socio-economic surveys and consultations with APs during for RP preparation. This is to ensure consistency of approach and avoid variation in information obtained and given and to address issues immediately as they arise on site;
- Ensure that the RP preparation consultants should in conformity with the RF provisions and the impacted assets should be accurately assessed and linked to the respective APs.
- Coordinate with supervisory consultants, Board of Revenue and other line departments and SSWMB to streamline resettlement planning activities

- Internally review the RF and RPs (draft/updated), coordinate with World Bank in review and approval process, and ensure timely disclosure of approved RPs on IAs Website and translation of Summary RPs in local language for disclosure to APs;
- Coordinate with the ESC for review of RP implementation progress and ensure timely preparation of quality monitoring reports. The monitoring reports will be internally reviewed to ensure quality final reports are shared with World Bank for review and acceptance and shall ensure timely disclosure of approved monitoring reports on IAs Website.
- Ensure timely disclosure of design and resettlement related information to the APs which may include information on project alignment and design, ROW land acquisition process and publication of notices under LAA provisions by the LAC in a format and language easily understood by APs and at easily accessible places.

9.3 Environment and Social Cell (ESC)

A dedicated ESC will be nested in PIU. PIU will recruit a full time Resettlement Specialist with the relevant experience of handling social safeguards issues for planning, implementation and monitoring subprojects. The ESC team will also include a Social Development Specialist (focusing on gender and community engagement) to address resettlement issues and also to liaise with communities particularly with marginalized groups such as waste pickers. The Team will also be responsible for grievance redress and organizing training programs on social management aspects and the successful implementation of the RF activities

To achieve this, the role and responsibilities of the ESC will be as follows.

- Screens proposals/studies for the subprojects related to safeguards issues in compliance with safeguards requirements specified in this RF
- Maintains records of all proposals and screening decisions.
- Ensure that the supervisory consultants will implement the TOR consistently particularly for safeguards mainstreaming in terms of process and outputs;
- Provide general oversight of activities with resettlement impacts to ensure compliance with this RF;
- Help IAs in relocated APs and ensure compensation payment in timely manner;
- Function as grievance redress office on resettlement related matters/concerns raised by the APs during RP preparation or the complaints forwarded by the project GRC or by the APs unsatisfied with decision of the project GRC. The complaints will be registered and acknowledged to APs and addressed after investigating the facts and hearing the complainants.
- Facilitate information dissemination and consultation with APs including men, women and vulnerable groups in subproject towns on all matters affecting APs to ensure compliance with the requirements of the RF, World Bank's ESF and GoS policies.
- Keep the social management framework updated, based on the project's operational experience.

9.4 Grievance Redress Committee

A project-wide Grievance Redress Mechanism (GRM) will be set up for all subprojects under the investment program to address grievances arising from social and environmental impacts. The GRM will have a two-tiered structure at the subproject level and another third tier at the executing agency level, enabling immediate local responses to grievances and higher-level review addressing more difficult cases not resolved at the local level. At project/subproject level, a grievance redress committee will be established to operationalize the GRM at the PIU level. The formation of GRC and its functions will commensurate with subproject needs and requirements and will be elaborated in each subproject RP. Further details of the GRM are provided in section 11.

9.5 Supervisory Consultants

Environment and social (E&S) supervisory consultants having adequate human resources for project implementation will be engaged. Supervisory consultants will also assist the IA in planning and preparation for E&S management, and implementation and monitoring of the project RF. The Supervisory consultants will mobilize a team of qualified resettlement specialist with experienced enumerators and surveyors for impact assessment, census, SES surveys and conducting meaning consultations during project design stage who will facilitate the PIU in updating the RF (if required) or draft RPs prepared based on feasibility level design for subprojects. Overall social management responsibilities of the SC include:

- Undertake the screening of each subproject and identify main social impacts and prepare project descriptions;
- Undertake adequate consultations with affected people and other stakeholders of the subproject area to identify baseline conditions and impacts;
- Ensure timely disclosure of information to all APs about project design alignment, land acquisition notifications issued by the LAC and facilitate information dissemination and consultation with APs on all matters and disclosure of RP provisions and information about the GRM and compensation payment mechanism;
- Monitor day to implementation progress and prepare monthly progress reports and periodic social monitoring reports including consolidated progress of RP implementation and social management achieved during monitoring period;
- Provide technical assistance and training to the ESC, line departments, SEPA and contractors and advice on appropriate modifications to improve their effectiveness; and
- Assist PIU in preparing bi-annual subproject reports on the RF implementation, to be submitted to the Steering Committee and the World Bank.

9.6 Independent Monitoring Agency (IMA)

IAs will hire an agency or an individual expert (with team) to conduct independent monitoring and evaluation (the IMA) for the implementation of RP. The IMA shall review the implementation progress throughout the RP implementation and evaluate the level of achievement of RP objectives, identify gaps, if any, and propose remedial measures for implementation. The IMA shall be a firm hired either for all Project under the investment or for individual subprojects.

10 IMPLEMENTATION PROCESS OF LINKING RESETTLEMENT IMPLEMENTATION TO CIVIL WORKS

Compensation payments for affected assets and resettlement of households, must be completed as a condition for clearing of public land before commencement of the civil works under the project.

APs must confirm that resettlement plans contain acceptable measures that link resettlement activity to civil works, in compliance with this document. Timing and coordination of civil works shall ensure that no affected persons will be displaced either economically or physically due to civil works activity, before compensation is paid and before any project activity can begin.

The following are key considerations regarding linking resettlement implementation to the civil works:

- RPs need to be cleared by the Bank and disclosed prior to issuing bids for associated construction works
- Civil works shall commence only after implementation of RPs and the IA taking over the site.

DRAFT

11 GRIEVANCE REDRESS MECHANISM

This section lays out the existing grievance redress mechanisms (GRM) in place in the two key institutions responsible for project implementation, in addition to delineating proposed GRM procedures for the project itself. As per World Bank requirements, GRM systems are an integral component of the project administration. Paragraph 26 of ESS 10 says that, “the Borrower will respond to concerns and grievances of project-affected parties related to the environmental and social performance of the project in a timely manner. For this purpose, the Borrower will propose and implement a grievance mechanism to receive and facilitate resolution of such concerns and grievances.”

11.1 Existing Mechanisms

SSWMB: Grievance redress mechanisms are now a fundamental element in all service delivery departments of the GOS. In case of SSWMB, the Board operates a Citizens Portal where citizens can log in suggestions and complaints on all SWM related issues.⁴ Complaints are automatically forwarded to the concerned Deputy Director for appropriate remedial actions. Citizens can upload pictures/videos/audio files or even handwritten text files in support of their complaints. The portal also enables the SSWMB to communicate directly with citizens to make routine and urgent announcements. The Board also maintains a Facebook page which is updated regularly, and which allows FB users to send messages directly, or use an email address displayed on the page to file complaints or give suggestions.

KMC: KMC also has an online complaint system through its website.⁵ Overall, KMC has set up a system called Citizen Complaint and Information System (CCIS), through which complaints of the citizens are registered and managed. Under this system the citizens can lodge a complaint through three methods:

- Citizen’s Call Centre which is functional 24/7 and can be easily accessed on their dedicated number.
- Citizens can also walk into one of the facilitation centres that are spread across 21 locations throughout the city, and lodge a complaint.
- The complaints can also be lodged through the online portal, where basic information like nature of complaints, departments, CNICs and phone number is required to lodge a complaint.

Once a complaint is recorded in the system, they are all logged into a CCIS central database. The complaints from the central database are then sent to the relevant departments and officials, and the status of the complaint is monitored through the system. Once the relevant official marks the complaint as resolved, the Quality Control Section of CCIS, gets in touch with the complainants and confirms whether their complaint was resolved or not. If the complaint is still unresolved, it’s not only redirected but also accelerated to higher officials of the relevant department for resolution. The entire complaint management system can also be viewed in real time by the relevant officials, such as the Mayor and Deputy Mayor.

11.2 GRM Systems for the Project

The project will have its own GRM system as delineated below. Until this is in place, queries and complaints related to the project can either be directed through existing GRM systems (described in Section 6.1), or can be routed to the following:

Mr. Zubair Ahmed Channa, Managing Director, SSWMB/ Project Director, SWEEP PIU
Tel: 021-99333701, Email: md@sswmb.gos.pk

Syed Muhammad Afzal Zaidi, Metropolitan Commissioner, KMC/ Project Director, CLICK
Tel: (021)99216095, Email: commissioner@kmc.gos.pk

⁴ See: http://sswmb.gos.pk/cms/?page_id=1534

⁵ See: <http://complaint.kmc.gos.pk/ccis/General/Complaint/LogNew.aspx>

A Grievance Redress Committee (GRC) will be constituted at the PIU, managed by the Social Development Specialist (SDS). Other than SDS, the Committee will draw on existing resources at the SSWMB and will comprise of four additional members as follows.

Table 2 : Constitution of the Grievance Redress Committee

Designation	Parent Department
Head of the GRC	SSWMB
Director GRC	SSWMB/PIU
Social Development Specialist (SRS)/Secretary to GRC	PIU
Administrator and Investigation	PIU
Nominee from KMC	KMC
Nominees (including one woman) of APs	Communities

Thus, a designated officer from the SSWMB will serve as Head of the GRC. The Head of the GRC, Director GRC, and the nominee from KMC will work at their parent agencies, but will be available to the GRC to decide on complaints that need responses from senior officials or inter-departmental cooperation, or which are otherwise complex in some way. Day to day issues will be handled by the SRS, with assistance from the Resettlement Specialist, an Administrator and support staff who will handle the GRM system. An officer with experience of working in the CCIS of the KMC will be nominated by KMC over the initial months of the project to address any complaints concerning cleaning of nullahs.

11.3 GRM System

As a first step, an online complaint registration system will be set up for the project, which will also link with the SSWMB's Citizen's Portal. Thus, it will pick up relevant complaints from the Portal, as well as complaints registered on it directly. Complaint registration will be structured such that complaints can be entered directly on the website (in English or Urdu); can be posted to a designated address as letters or written messages; or can be narrated to operators on a helpline. All complaints, however made, will be consolidated into a database on a daily basis, and separated by location as well as subject.

As a second step, grievances/complaints will be screened and classified into three categories by order of priority, with those requiring instant action being classified as high priority. A set of criteria will be made to determine what sort of grievances/complaints fall into which category. All registered grievances/complaints will be acknowledged through a text message or phone call. If no telephone number is supplied by the complainant, he or she will be asked through a letter to check back with the PIU. This acknowledgement will be issued within one day of receipt of the grievance/complaint. Each complainant will be given an estimated timeframe for resolution of the grievance/complaint.

Grievances will be investigated and resolved within the timeframe specified, which will not be longer than ten days. If resolution demands longer than this timeframe, the complainant will be informed, and will be contacted by staff from the PIU to explain details of the issue. Grievances which require cooperation of a number of departments, or which are otherwise complicated, will be referred to the GRC who will specify how resolution is to take place.

Records of all grievances/complaints will be maintained in a database, including details of actions taken to resolve the issue, and dates on which resolution was effected. At the conclusion of action to solve grievances, the complainants will be informed of the outcome. Two days after action is closed and complainants informed, they will be contacted again to ensure that they are satisfied with the work done. The system will include a system for Appeals. If a complainant remains unsatisfied, he/she will be able to lodge an appeal, which will be escalated to the Head of the GRC or the Director.

11.4 Handling Gender Based Violence (GBV) and Violence and Against Children (VAC) issues

The project will be particularly sensitive to GBV and VAC issues given that its key stakeholders include marginalized communities, whose women and children are particularly vulnerable to abuse. Grievances related to GBV will be handled as a separate, category within the GRM system. The PIU staff responsible for receiving complaints, the SDS and Resettlement Specialist will receive training on receiving complaints regarding GBV and VAC from a certified and reputable organization/NGO focusing on issues of GBV and VAC. The organization will also draw up a list of established service providers who can provide support to GBV and VAC survivors and all relevant cases will be referred accordingly. This element of the GRM will be further refined in light of the GBV Action Plan that will be prepared for the project.

DRAFT

12 DESCRIPTION OF THE ARRANGMENT OF RESETTLEMENT FUNDING

12.1 Preparation of Cost Estimates

World Bank ESS5 provisions under this RF require that no physical or economic displacement for subproject construction will occur until (i) the RPs prepared in line with the RF have been implemented and compensation and any other entitlements, in line with the RF and specified in the RPs, has been provided to APs; and, if required (ii) a comprehensive income and livelihood rehabilitation program, supported by an adequate budget, is in place to help APs improve, or at least restore, their incomes and livelihoods.

Ensuring that compensation and associated resettlement activities are provided in advance of development works requires a degree of certainty around sources of funding and mechanisms for ensuring the efficient flow of funding. The procedures spelt out in this section offer guidance to ensure compliance with the World Bank's ESF. This RF offers guidance to ensure that resettlement plans associated with projects include the preparation of budgets and work plans that comply with ESS5. This RF does not make provision for compensation or resettlement associated with land acquired by private interests for private purposes, which is not the project's requirement.

In case the RP implementation would delay by more than one year, the unit costs will be updated to include the annual inflation rate.

12.2 Flow of funds

The allocation and provision of the financial resource is responsibility of the IA for effective management of project resettlement requirements including clearance of public land specified for civil works/construction free from encumbrances, establishment of relocation/resettlement sites, payment of compensation for acquired assets, entitled relocation and resettlement costs and implementation of income restoration measures etc. Hence, compensation, assistance, relocation and rehabilitation of income and livelihood will be considered as an integral component of project costs and will be accordingly estimated and included in the project documents to ensure adequate funds are made available.

Funds for structure compensation and resettlement will be budgeted for in advance of the commencement of project works. A budget to cover associated compensation for lost assets and resettlement of APs will come from IAs. The IA will fund resettlement costs through the establishment of a compensation fund. This fund will be established in advance of the project activities. Where appropriate, these costs will be identified as part of an environmental and social impact assessment prepared in advance of development approval. A project involuntary resettlement budget will be prepared to include a component for the cost of compensation of lost assets to be acquired from APs. Consistent with procedures laid out in RPF, the budget shall include compensation for loss of residential structures and budget for implementation of resettlement activities shall be the responsibility of IAs and in consultation with APs.

12.3 Contingency arrangement

The resettlement costs will be precisely assessed and reflected in the itemized RP budget including compensation costs for construction of adequate housing and applicable relocation, resettlement and income restoration costs as well as administrative costs including costs for RP implementation institutional arrangement, monitoring and evaluation and the sufficient contingencies allocation for unforeseen expenses. Any unanticipated losses that would occur during the projects' implementation will be documented, impacts will be assessed and addendum to the RAPs will be prepared to systematically compensate the losses. The addendums including budgetary provisions will be reviewed and cleared by the World Bank.

12.4 RP Implementation Schedule and Commencement of Works

The RP preparation and implementation schedule will vary from subproject to subproject based on readiness level of subproject design and resettlement requirements. In terms of resettlement planning, the project

implementation will consist of the three major phases, namely project preparation, clearance of ROW and final/updated RPs preparation and implementation of RPs, i.e., relocation of APs to resettlement sites, full payment of compensation for cleared assets and entitled resettlement and rehabilitation cost to APs with income restoration measure in place. In line with the principles laid down in this RF, IA will prepare a detailed implementation schedule as integral part of each RP indicating the sequence and time frame of activities for acquisition of land, preparation of draft and implementation ready RPs for each subproject under different phases and RP implementation timelines synchronized with the construction schedule for each subproject.

The commencement of civil works for any subproject or any of its section with resettlement impacts will be conditional upon full implementation of the IAs endorsed and World Bank cleared RPs which will be spelled out in the project/ loan covenants to ensure ESS5 requirements are fully complied with.

A detailed implementation schedule will be prepared for each RP indicating the sequence and time frame of activities, including (i) clearance of the sites; (ii) release of funds to the acquiring agency; (iii) disbursement of compensation for various categories of assets and income losses; (iv) relocation and livelihood restoration/substitution measures; (v) demolition of structures and transfer of public land free from encumbrances ; and (vi) grievance redress and M&E.

DRAFT

13 STAKEHOLDER CONSULTATION AND INFORMATION DISCLOSURE

13.1 Consultation with Key Stakeholders

Due to the restrictions of the COVID-19 crisis, limited consultations were conducted with community living within the proposed project site at Jam Chakro. Consultations will be conducted with the stakeholders, during the process of updating this RF, to solicit their views, identify their needs and preferences for compensation and rehabilitation measures and relocation. As the project proceeds and if COVID-19 restrictions continue, the reliance on communication through meeting apps and mobile phones, and the dissemination of information through electronic and social media will be continued. If required, face to face community interaction will be conducted in small groups in suitable locations (allowing for light, air, and for participants to sit a reasonable distance apart). In densely populated communities where following physical distancing SOPs may be difficult to follow, FGDs will be discarded in favor of key informant interviews. As COVID restrictions are relaxed, some forms of electronic communication will be replaced in communities with face to face contact through social organizers or community-based workers, and workshops or roundtables/people's assemblies will be organized.

Meaningful consultations will be carried out particularly with APs, communities and other key stakeholders during preparation and implementation of RAP of each subproject to solicit their views, identify their needs and preferences for compensation and rehabilitation measures and relocation. The nature and timing of these consultations will vary depending upon the implementation stage of the project. Subproject specific stakeholders will be identified through the initial social assessment of each subproject. Stakeholder consultations and information dissemination will be carried out over the preparation of the subproject through community meetings, focus group discussions and interviews of key informants so that they can share their views and recommendations for the subproject preparation and implementation. These recommendations will be included in the subproject RAP and with description of actions defined to address them.

The ESC team will retain a close liaison with the APs and other stakeholders. The AP and other stakeholders will be informed on their rights, eligibility, compensation entitlements, payment procedures and requirements. The project-based grievance redress system with grievance handling mechanism will be explained and the APs will be kept informed during resolution of grievances. The information related to land acquisition process and status, processing of claims, payment of compensation timelines for acquired assets and delivery of resettlement, rehabilitation and income restoration costs/measure will be provided repeatedly.

The consultation meetings with all stakeholders will be recorded and documented comprehensively, including signed attendance lists, photographs and minutes of the key issues addressed and agreements reached, observations made in the field, and outstanding issues in need of being addressed. The consultations will be documented in the RAP with consultation records appended. This information will be updated for each RAP update and will also be continued in the LAR monitoring reports.

13.2 Consultations Framework during Project Implementation

The PIU will be responsible for managing and conducting meaningful consultation with directly affected persons and other affected groups throughout the project lifecycle. The most commonly used approaches to consultations, information sharing and engagement with stakeholders are outlined as follows:

- Wider community consultations include a broad representation of the communities through mass public meetings;
- One-to-one consultations with the people that will be directly affected by the Project;
- Targeted stakeholders' consultations including specific groups of affected persons such as APs losing agricultural land, communities losing common lands and forest trees under customary rights, communities losing access, etc.
- Workshops including representatives of local authorities and representatives of the affected persons and communities;

- Focus group discussions including representatives of local authorities, communities, women's groups, youth groups, and any other third parties to discuss specific project-related issues and gather participants' opinions, suggestions and concerns;
- Key informant interviews are conducted mostly during the project preparation phase to generate information and ideas about the Project. The key informants may include community leaders, public representatives, heads of the AHs, women heads of the AHs, community organization, NGO, officials of relevant institutions, experts from academia and civil society;
- Face-to-face meetings with the APs will be held to clarify confidential information on the compensation amount, particular entitlements related to the APs' affected lands and other assets, complaints or concerns related to the project, as needed;

Consultation proceedings will be properly documented. The essential documents will include: date, location, a list of the key issues raised by the participants, agreed actions, photographic records, and list(s) of participants. The minutes of the consultations, together with scanned sign-in sheets of the participants will be included in the monthly and quarterly reports and in the RAPs. The data should be disaggregated by gender, with the key information recorded at the top of the minutes, stating the number of participants, the number of men, and the number of female participants. A stand-alone Stakeholder Engagement Plan (SEP) has been prepared for providing details on stakeholder consultations.

13.3 RP Disclosure and Dissemination

The RF for SWEEP and RPs prepared for each subproject to be implemented under the Project and periodic social monitoring reports prepared will be subject to disclosure. This preliminary RF will be disclosed on World Bank and IA's websites before appraisal of the project, and the updated RF will be disclosed on the Bank and IA websites within 60 days of project effectiveness. Any subsequent subproject RPs will also be disclosed on the IA and Bank websites before the implementation of the RPs. RF and RPs will also be made available to APs and other stakeholders by placing the copies at accessible including the relevant PIU and District and Town offices along the Project corridor.

IAS will prepare an Information Brochure in Urdu Language including summary information on the key aspects of the resettlement process of a subproject including but not limited to subproject summary and social impacts, grievance redress mechanism with institutional set-up, general eligibility and entitlement provisions. Such brochure will be disseminated to the APs during preparation and updating of the RPs. In addition, the cut-off date and other information on relevant issues will be disclosed to APs and other stakeholders in the project area through leaflets in Urdu made available at project and relevant government offices. For illiterate people, other suitable communication methods will be used.

14 MONITORING AND EVALUATION

14.1 Overview

The major objectives of monitoring and evaluation are to: (i) ascertain whether activities are progressing as per schedule and the specified timelines are being met; (ii) assess if compensation, rehabilitation measures are sufficient; (iii) identify problems or potential issues; (iv) identify methods and corrective actions to rapidly mitigate any problems and (v) ensure that RP objectives are met with and the standards of living of APs are restored or improved; (vi) collect gender disaggregated information to monitor the day-to-day resettlement activities of the project through the following (a) Review of project information for all APs; (b) Consultation and informal interviews with APs; (c) Key informant interviews; and, (d) Community public meetings.

The resettlement tasks will be monitored internally and externally. The PIU will provide World Bank with an effective basis for assessing resettlement progress and identifying potential difficulties and problems related to scope and the subproject's risks and impacts.

14.2 Internal Monitoring

Internal monitoring will be the responsibility of the ESC of the PIU. The internal monitoring will include the following: (i) Administrative monitoring: daily planning, implementation, feedback and troubleshooting, individual displaced person database maintenance, and progress reports; (ii) Socio-economic monitoring: case studies, using baseline information for comparing displaced persons socio-economic conditions, evacuation, demolition, salvaging materials, community relationships, dates for consultations, and number of appeals placed; and (iii) Impact evaluation monitoring: Income standards restored/improved, and socioeconomic conditions of the displaced persons.

The indicators for internal monitoring will be subject related to immediate activities for RP implementation and its outputs and results. This information will be collected directly from the field. It will be used to assess the progress and results of RP implementation, and to adjust the work program, if necessary. These monitoring activities will continue until resettlement is completed.

The consultant will monitor and verify RP implementation to determine whether resettlement goals have been achieved, livelihood and living standards have been restored, and provide recommendations for improvement. In order to ensure that all displaced households are compensated prior to commencement of civil work. Potential monitoring indicators from which specific indicators can be developed and refined according to the census for each subproject are set out in **Table 3** below.

Table 3: Potential indicators for internal monitoring

Monitoring Aspects	Potential Indicators
Institutional set-up and resource allocation	RP implementation, monitoring institutional set-up and budget in place. Grievance redress mechanism established and explained to the APs and affected communities.
Delivery of Entitlements	Compensation entitlements disbursed, compared with number and category of losses set out in the entitlement matrix. Relocation and rehabilitation costs and income restoration support provided as per entitlements and schedule Income and livelihood restoration activities being implemented as set out in the income restoration plan.
Restoration of living a standard and income	Affected residential structures reconstructed/restored at relocation sites Number and percentage of displaced persons covered under livelihood restoration and rehabilitation programs (women, men, and vulnerable groups). Number of displaced persons who have restored their income and livelihood patterns (women, men, and vulnerable groups). No. of APs (especially vulnerable) provided opportunities in project related employment.

Monitoring Aspects	Potential Indicators
	Percentage of displaced persons who improved their income and living standard (women, men, and vulnerable groups).
Consultation and Grievances	Consultations organized as scheduled including meetings, groups, and community activities. Community awareness about grievance redresses mechanism and its use. Progress on grievances recorded and resolved including information dissemination to affected families on the resolution of the grievances. Information on the implementation of the social preparation phase and implementation of special measures for vulnerable groups.
Communications and Participation	Number of meetings held with APs (male and female) to explain RP provisions, grievance redress mechanism and compensation disbursement mechanism. Number of APs (male female) participated in the meetings. Number of meetings and consultations held with vulnerable people.

14.3 External Monitoring

External monitoring will be undertaken of the RP, based on which a Compliance Report will be submitted to World Bank EA and IA. The Monitoring/Compliance report will be used by WB and EA as a basis to issue notice to proceed with civil work activities to the contractor for site preparation. The report will be published on the website of the EA, IA and WB. Independent monitoring will continue beyond the implementation periods of RP.

The extent of monitoring activities, including their scope and periodicity, will be commensurate with the project's risks and impacts. In case of subproject with significant resettlement impacts, IAs through PIU will engage the services of an independent agency or consultant, not associated with project implementation, to undertake external monitoring and evaluation of the RP implementation particularly for "High and Substantial Risks" subprojects.

An Independent or Third-Party Monitoring Agency or an individual with a team (IMA) will carry out external monitoring of RP and report monitoring results to IA and World Bank through semi-annual monitoring reports or with a frequency as agreed with WB. The external monitor will monitor and verify RP implementation progress and assess the achievement of RP objectives and compliance with World Bank's safeguards requirement's through review of RP implementation progress reports, periodic internal monitoring reports and through, consultations with the APs and other stakeholders and impact assessment based on filed surveys. The key tasks of the external monitor will include:

Table 4 below presents a set of suggested indicators for verification of the monitoring information of the IAs by qualified and experienced external monitor.

Table 4: Potential Indicators for External Monitor

Monitoring Indicator	Basis for Indicator
Basic information on displaced persons' households (Gender disaggregated data essential for all aspects)	Project location including description on project intervention and IR impacts. Composition and structure, ages, educational, and skill levels with gender of household Head Vulnerable households Land and other resource-owning and resource-using patterns Occupations and employment patterns and income sources and levels Participation in neighborhood or community groups and access to cultural sites and events.
Compensation payment and Restoration of living standards	Compensation for acquired assets including structures and other assets delivered. Compensation payments sufficient to replace lost assets?

Monitoring Indicator	Basis for Indicator
	Replacement of affected assets particularly residential, productive assets and key social and cultural elements?
Restoration of livelihoods (Disaggregate data for displaced persons moving to group resettlement sites, self-relocating displaced persons, displaced persons with enterprises affected.)	Have affected enterprises received sufficient assistance to reestablish themselves? Have vulnerable groups been provided income-earning opportunities? Are these opportunities effective and sustainable? Do jobs provided restore pre-project income levels and living standards?
Information and satisfaction levels of displaced persons.	How much do the displaced persons know about resettlement procedures and entitlements? Do the displaced persons know their entitlements and aware on whether these have been met? What is the perception of displaced persons about the extent and level to which their living standards and livelihoods have been restored? How much do the displaced persons know about grievance procedures and conflict resolution procedures?
Effectiveness of resettlement planning	Were the displaced persons and their assets correctly enumerated? Was the time frame and budget sufficient to meet objectives, were there institutional constraints? Were entitlements based on replacement costs and adequate for rehabilitation and restoration of the APs? Were vulnerable groups identified and assisted adequately? How did resettlement implementers deal with unforeseen problems?

Based on the independent monitor's report, if significant issues are identified, a corrective action plan will be prepared, reviewed and approved by World Bank and disclosed to affected persons. In addition to the above defined monitoring mechanism, the World Bank will also keep a close oversight on the subprojects implemented under the SWEEP and will keep monitoring subproject on an ongoing basis by launching safeguards review missions until a subproject completion report is issued.

14.4 Reporting and Disclosure Requirements

The IAs will prepare and submit quarterly (if not agreed otherwise in the RPs) social safeguards monitoring reports to World Bank as part of project implementation performance monitoring. Such periodic monitoring reports documenting progress on resettlement implementation and resettlement plan completion reports will be provided through PIU to World Bank for review and disclosure. In case of subproject with significant IR impacts, the monitoring reports will be prepared by an independent monitor who will prepare and submit bi-annual monitoring reports to IA and World Bank's review and disclosures. IA will also submit subproject completion reports to World Bank for each site when compensation has been paid. In addition to the routine monitoring reports, in cases wherever required and agreed between IA and World Bank during execution of the project the PIU will prepare supplementary monitoring reports and share these with World Bank. All monitoring reports will subject to disclosure and will be disclosed on World Bank and IA websites as and when cleared by World Bank.